

LEAD CONSULTANT	PRICE (incl. GST)	PREVIOUS EXPERIENCE	UNDERSTANDING OF PROJECT AND PROJECT TEAM	INNOVATION DEMONSTRATED	AVERAGED SCORE*
Hames Sharley	\$95,700	Experience with similar major projects such as Joondalup City Centre, Melville City Vision (Garden City Booragoon), Subiaco Square, Bassendean Town Centre, Peninsula Burswood, Stirling Regional Centre (representing Innaloo Shopping Centre), Midland Centre Study, Cottesloe Town Centre and Maddington Town Centre	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good understanding of the project scope • Retail planning experience • Specialist consultant Pracsys to assess economic factors • Specialist community consultation consultant • Good mix of relevant skills 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Received several awards including UDIA awards for Subiaco and Joondalup projects • Want to avoid “clichés” like a ‘café on every corner’ and explore potential future scenarios with Council and the community • High quality visual presentation techniques 	88%
TPG	\$110,000	Experience with major local projects such as Midland Centre Revitalisation, Maylands Urban Design Framework, Victoria Park Town Centre Structure Plan, Subi Centro Masterplan, Wungong Masterplan (Armadale) and Mirrabooka Regional Centre Study	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good understanding of the project scope • Good mix of skills across project team • A 3D model is not required in the Tender Brief though 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High quality visual presentation techniques • Less innovation demonstrated in Tender 	78%
Roberts Day	\$104,885	Experience with major projects, however these are mainly new developments on greenfield sites such as Ellenbrook, South Yanchep and Frasers Landing (Mandurah)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good understanding of the project scope • Mix of skills, however no economic or retail skills included in project team • Project manager is less experienced 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has shown innovation in a number of their projects including Ellenbrook, Perry Lakes, Frasers Landing • High quality visual presentation techniques • Demonstrated sketches/drawings a bit too conceptual 	68%
Urbis	\$109,354	Some experience including Royal Street West Masterplan (EPRA), Kununurra Enquiry by Design, Byford Town Centre and Peppermint Grove Town Planning Scheme and Local Planning Strategy. Few local examples of similar major planning and urban design projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good understanding of Morley and relevant issues • High quality community consultation consultant • A lot of exclusions from Tender (page 47) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High quality visual presentation techniques • Less innovation demonstrated in Tender 	68%

Council Attachment 1 Tender Assessment	Morley City Centre Masterplan Tender Presentations and Appointment	2 November 2009 Page 2 of 3
--	--	------------------------------------

LEAD CONSULTANT	PRICE (incl. GST)	PREVIOUS EXPERIENCE	UNDERSTANDING OF PROJECT AND PROJECT TEAM	INNOVATION DEMONSTRATED	AVERAGED SCORE*
James Christou and Associates	\$85,497.50	Some experience with projects including EPRA Claisebrook Cove and Riverside developments, Claremont Quarter, The Mezz Mt Hawthorn, Cockburn Coast Masterplan. However, the consultants have undertaken several projects with the City that have not met all expectations including the original Maylands Multipurpose Centre design.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> An understanding of the project scope included in the tender document, however there have been misunderstanding issues in the past with previous projects undertaken for the City Good architectural and community consultation skills, but no traffic, economic or planning specialists 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Innovation demonstrated in previous projects, however this innovation is mainly architectural and not place based 	63%
Annand Alcock	\$233,200	Some experience including Stirling Highway Corridor Study, Waratah Avenue Dalkeith Design Guidelines and Rouse Hill Regional Centre (NSW). No direct experience with city centre rejuvenation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A good understanding of the project scope Good urban design and planning skills, but no traffic, economic or community consultation specialists Significantly exceeds project budget 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> High quality visual presentation techniques 	58%
Greg Rowe and Associates	\$191,477	Some experience including Jandakot Structure Plan, Port Bouvard and Gidgegannup town expansion. No direct experience with city centre rejuvenation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Good understanding of the project scope Planning and architectural skills, but no traffic, economic or community consultation specialists Significantly exceeds project budget 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Innovation and originality not adequately addressed in the Tender submitted 	57%
Gresley Abbas	\$253,610.50	Some experience including Belmont streetscapes policy, Claremont Masterplan and Mandurah Central Park Study. No direct experience with city centre rejuvenation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Seems to be repeating the project brief rather than demonstrating an understanding of the brief Planning and architectural skills, but no traffic or community consultation specialists Significantly exceeds project budget 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architectural innovation shown but otherwise fairly conventional approach 	53%

Council Attachment 1 Tender Assessment	Morley City Centre Masterplan Tender Presentations and Appointment	2 November 2009 Page 3 of 3
---	---	--

* - The averaged score was determined by the internal project group formed to assess the tenders.