

Deputations – Agenda Briefing Forum – 21 March 2023

1. 10.5.1 Proposed Temporary Road Closure

In relation to Item 10.5.1, Linda Slater will be in attendance, speaking in opposition to the officer's recommendation (*refer page 299*).

2. 10.5.1 Proposed Temporary Road Closure

In relation to Item 10.5.1, Vince Crea submitted a **written deputation** in opposition to the officer's recommendation (*refer page 299*).

3. 10.5.1 Proposed Temporary Road Closure

In relation to Item 10.5.1, Greg DaRui submitted a **written deputation** in opposition to the officer's recommendation (*refer page 299*).

4. 10.5.1 Proposed Temporary Road Closure

In relation to Item 10.5.1, Paul Shanahan submitted a **written deputation** in opposition to the officer's recommendation (*refer page 299*)

WRITTEN DEPUTATIONS

2. 10.5.1 Proposed Temporary Road Closure

Vince Crea

I oppose the proposed chicanes/speed humps designated for Copley Street unless they are temporary and removed within 7 days of the Beechboro Rd - Whatley Cres Link opening. The diagram does not show the proposed chicane/speed hump site in relation to my driveway at 3-5 Copley St. There are currently two chicanes on either side of the Copley and Drake Streets intersection.

3. 10.5.1 Proposed Temporary Road Closure

Greg DaRui



7 King William Street, Bayswater Town Centre WA 6053 bta.inc6053@gmail.com <https://www.facebook.com/BayswaterTraders>

CEO, City of Bayswater
Submissions ~ Temporary Road Closures for Bayswater Train Station
Mail@bayswater.wa.gov.au

Friday 10 March 2023

SUBMISSION AGAINST ROADS AND TRAIN STATION CLOSURES

The Baywater Traders Association Inc is opposed to the station closure and Beechboro Road South because of

- The misinformation that has been presented at the CAG meetings is very different to what is now being proposed.
- The impact on retailers with no plan to support or mitigate the detrimental impacts on the town centre
- The impact on the local community to access their retailers.
- Lack of notice for Businesses to prepare customers for the town centre being cut in the middle
- The impact on pedestrians trying to get from one side of the Townsite to the other.
- Compensation for the loss of trade and disruption to business in the town centre.

Community Advisory Group

The BTA has had a representative at all Metronet CAG meetings and the information given at all times was the old station would not be taken down until the new train station was commissioned.

Further the Metronet message was there would be no street closures of Beechboro Rd until the new Beechboro-Whatley connection was completed and open for vehicles.

Both of these assertions have been reneged on by the new proposal. This is not acceptable.

It appears the CAG is simply a token 'tick the box' exercise for spin and obfuscation – as we are not being told what is really being proposed until the very last moment, that we are then told is 'too late to change'.

Road Closures cut the town in half.

BTA Inc members are increasingly concerned about the increasing number of road closures with insufficient advance warning, making it impossible for customers to access retailers and making it difficult for deliveries.

Concerns include lost revenue, lost customers who may not come back and the fact that more business are either moving from the town centre or closing down. There is obviously a lack of support and care for existing business in an already troubled construction environment.

The Community is unaware of how to access their preferred shops. Putting something on the internet does not reach the whole community, particularly the elderly and the more vulnerable. There needs to be a letterbox drop of the whole area every time there is a disruption and direct human communication to the businesses affected.

A couple of examples.

Mertome Village, a retirement Village, Foyle Villas, retirement living, are on the North side of the railway and the Supermarket, Post Office Newsagent, Pharmacy, Cafes (where they can engage with the local Community), are on the South side. How will they access both sides of the town, with a hard close in the middle of the town centre? The proposed closures are insensitive to the local community.

Pedestrian Access

Asking pedestrians to walk up to the Leake Street underpass to get from one side of the town to the other is a long walk – elderly people will not manage the distance.

Metronet must investigate installing a gantry/ covered protection for pedestrians to walk between the north and south of the town centre for the duration of the Coode and Beechboro Road South closures.

Station Closure

Six months of the station being closed is a major shock and disruption. Further the disingenuous advertising of the station closure – headline reads 'Coode street and Beechboro Road closures' – but in the fine print we read that the station will close for SIX months until September at least. This is not acceptable to the BTA Inc

Meltham shuttle bus – where is the terminus proposed to be located, how do public transport users access each side of the town centre?

Access to Business

Beechboro Road South changes from a road with a significant amount of traffic to a 'local traffic only'. What affect have you modelled for the local businesses and property owners? Signage must not block traffic, only warn of the road closure displaying 'Business & Local traffic'

The BTA Inc does not support the station closure for more than a weekend.

The BTA Inc does not support railway parade closure and train station closure at the same time.

Evolve Bayswater and Metronet must suggest solutions to assist the businesses in the area.

We demand:

- A review of options considered by the contractor.
- A project timeline before works are approved, with timely updates to traders if delayed.
- A better plan to divert traffic that doesn't cut off the business.
- A better plan to minimise the impact of residence and business.
- Upfront compensation for the false promises and expected loss of revenue.
- No business be forced to close or relocate because of the road and railway closure.

What compensation is available to retailers who see a reduction in trade, or relocation costs for those choosing to move out of the town centre, or simply close?

There must be a mechanism available for businesses that show a decrease in profitability – or relocation assistance – over the course of the construction period to be compensated for their loss of income.

This is a basic WA State government "care factor" that show they care for small business and local communities, which are the fabric of our society.

Yours sincerely,



Greg DaRui
Chair, BTA Inc
0412 463 677

CC

Mayor Filomena Piffaretti, City of Bayswater

Lisa Baker MLA, Member for Maylands

Hon. Rita Saffioti MLA, Minister for Transport; Planning; Ports

4. 10.5.1 Proposed Temporary Road Closure

Paul Shanahan



FutureBayswater Community Group Inc

IARN: A1027361L ~ WA Incorporated Entity

FuBa Urban Regeneration Innovation Hub
Bayswater Town Centre WA 6053
vision@futurebayswater.com
<http://futurebayswater.com/>

CEO, City of Bayswater
Submissions ~ Temporary Road Closures for Bayswater Train Station
mail@bayswater.wa.gov.au

Friday 10 March 2023

SUBMISSION AGAINST ROADS AND TRAIN STATION CLOSURES

The request for a submission from the community for the temporary road closures proposed by Metronet is of great concern to the community. The feedback Future Bayswater Inc is receiving from the community reveals much confusion and growing disharmony with respect to the lack of clear, equitable and trustworthy communication by Metronet/Evolve.

Seeking accurate and timely feedback on the road/ station closures has been challenging.

Community members report that the standard response at the drop-in session with Metronet/Evolve on Thursday evening (09/03/23) was: *"The road closures haven't been decided yet. Your Council will decide it and are seeking feedback. It's the City who will approve it or not"*.

Upon questioning from community members what the alternative plan was if the Council rejected the proposal, the Metronet/Evolve representative admitted there was no Plan B, ie - no other alternative.

It seems that the proposed road closure is, therefore, a *fait accompli* and, hence, we question why the community is being engaged on such a proposal. This seems disingenuous if the decision has already been made to comply with the required process.

The feedback requested by the City, on the "Engage Bayswater" site, has three documents to respond to:

1. Midland and Airport Line shutdown notification February 2023 (91.8 KB) [pdf].
2. Upcoming Short-Term Road Closures (12.9 KB) [docx].
3. Existing Road Closures - Morley Ellenbrook Line (494 KB) [docx].

There are also three images to respond to:

1. Bayswater Train Station – New Road.
2. Traffic Signs and Controls During Closure.
3. Traffic Detours During Road Closure.

There is, unfortunately, also a lack of information, including:

1. Detailed traffic study to underpin the proposed road detours.
2. Detailed traffic management plan for the proposed closures.
3. Lack of detail and dates regarding the partial closure of Beechboro Rd South from Clavering to Drake St.

Given the amount of disruption this will cause the community and businesses, these documents should have been considered as essential to inform the feedback required.

To provide our feedback, however, Future Bayswater Inc will address the six official documents provided.

DOCUMENT 1 - Midland and Airport Line shutdown notification February 2023 (91.8 KB) [pdf]

While the title states that this document was made public by Metronet/Evolve in "February 2023", in reality, the first public notification was 15th February. This has provided only six (6) weeks' notice for these works to begin within which period feedback, engagement and approval was also to be sought.

The heading refers to the Midland and Airport Line Shutdown for nearly four weeks. It is only in the second paragraph that the document mentions, as if in passing, that the station would be closed for a total of six months. This type of communication is not clear, and appears to be downplaying what will be one of the greatest impacts the community, retailers and businesses will have to endure.

"Rail replacement buses will operate."

There is a lack of detail about how the replacement buses will work which is causing much angst in the community.

For example, there is no information provided on:

- Where the buses will leave from.
- How the north and south side of the town centre will access this replacement bus stop.

This information needs to be located in one central place with all other relevant information, not across multiple sites. It is unreasonable to expect that all members from the community will be able to successfully access/ find important information such as this from multiple locations on the internet. We have a broad community with different needs and ways of gathering information; not all members use digital media. Written notifications should be provided as well.

"What to expect"

This informs the community that the Leake Street underpass will be closed for two weeks from 31st March to 13th April. There is, however, no further information to let the community know if the Coode St/King William Street subway will be open during this period. This lack of detail is causing community concern - including parents of children who use this underpass to get to school. (Note: the crossing at this underpass has gone without a crossing guard in recent times – creating a dangerous situation for children trying to cross this busy road).

"Keep Informed"

Metronet/Evolve state they will provide an out-of-hours contact number during the closure – but it's unclear the closure of what? The Station? What is the purpose of the phone number? Is it the four major points of feedback we have regarding this document – which appears to be more focussed on the station closure than the road closures?

1. Future Bayswater Inc object, in principle, to the closure of the railway station for six months. We have had a member constantly in attendance at the Community Advisory Group over the last few years, and they were informed that the station would NOT close. Hence, this sudden decision is very surprising.
2. Much more information is required by the community about the proposed access between north and south sides of the railway line (Leake St underpass closure).
3. Clearer information should be letter box dropped to every household detailing the shuttle bus connections and applications for the "special Smart Rider". Route maps/ bus stop locations are considered essential.
4. A calendar of opening and closing dates for all closures -- roads, station, subway and underpasses -- should be provided both online and in written form. Hard copy information needs to be distributed so that it can be placed "on-the-fridge" and replaced when the information changes. Any information should also be distributed with adequate notice for the community and businesses.

DOCUMENT 2 - Upcoming Short-Term Road Closures (12.9 KB) [docx]

This document is provided with no references, page numbers, or even a map to help the community understand the information.

Firstly, it references "Blockade works above" without any detailed description. It makes it very difficult for the community and businesses to access proper information that affects their day-to-day existence.

"Works on the new bridge."

While this work has occurred, we assert that the communication for alternative vehicle routes and bus routes has been limited – making it difficult for drivers and those catching public transport to know how to plan their trips. The signage at the bus stops has often been incorrect; and temporary bus stops have been installed without information as to their purpose, location, and timetables being provided.

"Pre-blockade"

*Full closure of Railway Parade between Coode and Drake Street to all vehicles and cyclists
from Friday, 24 March to Friday, 31 March 2023*

This is only a short road closure, but again there is no information as to where the buses might go.

There is no information about the proposed Beechboro Rd South/ Clavering Rd intersection with "Local Traffic and Business Traffic Only" signs. When will these be installed? Without these signs it will likely force vehicles to run through the local suburban streets.

"Blockade Works"

(a) Full closure of Railway Parade between Coode and Drake Street. 31 March to Monday, 24 April

We understand that this is inevitable in terms of the design of the bus link road and bus turning circle design.

(b) Partial closure of Whatley Crescent eastbound between King William Street to Garratt Road to all vehicles for blockade works.

We understand that this short closure may be necessary for construction works. Greater communication regarding the pedestrian access from north to south is required.

"Old Bridge Demolition Works"

Friday, 14 April until Monday, 17 April 2023 (a weekend).

(a) Full closure of the King William Street/Whatley Crescent intersection to all vehicles, cyclists and pedestrians

This closes off the Coode/King William Street subway access between the north and south sides of the Bayswater Town Centre.

DOCUMENT 3 - "Upcoming Short-Term Road Closures (12.9 KB) [docx]

This document references that the Leake St Subway will be closed from 31st March to 13th April. There is no room for error in this instance with one pedestrian access closing 14th April and the other opening on 13th April. If there is any construction delay to the Leake St underpass works, there will be no pedestrian access between north and south sides of the rail line. It behoves Metronet/Evolve to keep the community informed throughout this period.

(b) "Partial closure of Coode Street between Broun Avenue and Railway Parade".

This is a main vehicular artery to two large sporting grounds, and although it's only a weekend and occurs in the school holidays, have the sporting clubs been notified of this change? Have all the schools been notified for any extracurricular activity that may occur at the time?

NB: at bottom of the page it states: *"Please note that there may be periodic restricted access to some properties, however, residents will be notified prior to any works commencing"*

Presently at three and five weeks out from these closures, have any of the residents been notified of possible restricted access? This should be of great significance as the effect of such could have much consequence to personal lives (private functions, home opens, weddings, delivery trucks etc).

Our feedback regarding this document is:

- These are short closures.
- There appears to be a lack of notice and information for residents, businesses, sporting clubs and other key local stakeholders.

- There is a risk of completely cutting of pedestrian access north and south sides of the rail line if the construction programme of Leake St. underpass is delayed.

DOCUMENT 4 - Existing Road Closures - Morley Ellenbrook Line (494 KB) (docx)

This document is the only one with both text and a map and mainly relates to the Industrial Area.

However, it is very much out of date with the Railway Pde 19-month closure proposed to commence on 18th August 2022; and the second partial closure commenced on 1st October 2022.

The only comment that can be made in relation to this document is regarding the information on the third proposed partial closure -- from Beechboro Road South to Bassendean Road commencing 29th May -- is that it provides a decent length of notice to the residents.

It will likely impact the residents for the entire 19 months; however, with proper notice provided to the residents during construction, the community will likely be able to endure the impacts and manage the disruption.

However, it is noted that during this time the detours for the Beechboro Rd South "Local Traffic" closure from March to September that traffic is also diverted down this now partially closed section of Railway Pde.

These pieces of information are derived from two different projects: MEL and Bayswater Station.

Has an integrated joined-up traffic study been done to ensure that the partially closed road can handle the traffic?

Without a traffic study on the effect of either project's road closures, it remains impossible to provide feedback other than an observational warning.

IMAGE 1 - Bayswater Train Station – New Road

This is simply an overlay of the proposed road layouts onto a photographic map of the area for the new Beechboro Link Road and Bus link road.

There is no feedback to give on this.

IMAGE 2 - Traffic Signs and Controls During Closure (Image)

This documents requires the feedback of an experienced traffic manager to assess whether it is adequate or could be improved.

To date the community has provided negative feedback regarding the traffic signage used for other closures, and this signage needs to improve for future road closures.

IMAGE 3 - Traffic Detours During Road Closure

This is probably the most important image as it illustrates clearly the problems with the closure of Beechboro Rd South to all but local traffic.

Of the six documents on the Engage Bayswater Page, this is the only one that notes the closure of Beechboro Rd South from Clavering to Drake St - but only in map form.

There is no additional text that addresses this issue – no dates or clarifying information.

More information is needed on exactly what is proposed including the dates.

A letter box drop leaflet was issued to residents, **Road closure and out-of-hours works, 2 -8 March 2023**. This only addressed the short closure over the long weekend and days either side, but it provides text AND a map indicating detours that match the document in this feedback engagement. In any case, that road closure has been and gone within this engagement period.

However we've been able to find information from the following sources:

1. **Upcoming Short-Term Road Closures (12.9 KB) [docx]**
Railway Parade remains closed to vehicles from 24 March to 24 April
2. **Road closure and out-of-hours works, 2 -8 March 2023**
A legible detour map.
3. **And CAG meeting discussions with the community and businesses**
Railway parade between Coode Street and Drake Street to be closed from March and the new realigned Railway Parade to re-open September. Detours will be put in place and local traffic access to areas will be provided.

EVERY TIME there is a road closure and/or underpass/subway closure, it significantly adversely impacts the community in many ways. Residents and businesses alike.

This proposed closure and detour has the greatest impact on the community and businesses of Bayswater.

The closure of Beechboro Road South to local traffic only – for 6 months – is at odds with the promise that Metronet gave to members of the CAG and the community and businesses at the start of the project. An undertaking was given that access to the Coode St/King William Street subway would not be closed before the Beechboro to Whatley link was in place and operational.

Future Bayswater Inc supports the original plans to keep the road open and, therefore, cannot support this late change to close the road because of the detrimental impact local businesses and the community.

The rationale for this change is not provided. Has there been a delay and need for a revised construction programme for the railway station?

To be notified only 2 weeks out of such a detour is not appropriate and lacks genuine consideration for the local businesses and residents.

We would assert that information needs to be provided about why this about-face on the road closures is now needed. Without this, we cannot support it. The communication lacks detail and is difficult to interpret.

At the Metronet drop-in session 09/03/2023, one of our members (not representing FuBa) asked how the Beechboro Rd South and Clavering Rd intersection would be handled. There was no meaningful response.

Our very real concern is that two weeks out, it appears that the team either do not know how it is going to be implemented or are not allowed to communicate it.

In addition, our member attending the drop-in session, reports that it was stated that it is up to the Council – after the community engagement – to approve these road closures, or not. If this is the case, why is all this happening at such short notice and without any detail?

It should be noted that it was also admitted by Metronet/Evolve to our member that there is no alternative if Council were to reject the road closure proposals. If that is the case, and the community and Council rejects the proposal, what happens then?

There is no traffic management or impact study to peruse or consider.

It is almost a “hope” that the traffic will detour in the way the map suggests. The reality is likely there will be increased rat-running for the duration of this closure. The community has a right to understand this impact over the entire duration of the proposed closure.

For those that rely on the only three bus routes in Bayswater Town Centre, THERE IS NO INFORMATION as to where to go to catch the bus, or even which direction the bus travels from each stop (ie – to Perth? Galleria?). It behoves such a large Government project to engage properly with the community and to provide quality information and in a timely manner.

CONCLUSION

The following represents a summary of the feedback:

1. The documents provided for the feedback do not provide the information needed to provide comprehensive feedback.
2. Much more information is required by the community as to ongoing access between north and south sides of the railway line (ie - Leake St Underpass closure), including details of all closures and proposed diversions.
3. Clearer information should be letterboxed to every household detailing the shuttle bus connections and applications for the “special Smart Rider”. Route maps/ bus stop locations are considered essential.
4. A Calendar of opening and closing dates for all closures – roads, station, subway and underpasses - should be provided. Hard copy visual representation of what is proposed needs to be provided to the community so that it can be placed “on-the-fridge” and replaced when the information changes. Also, any information should be distributed with adequate notice for the community and businesses.
5. The documents only refer to short closures that can be tolerated by the community. More information is needed on the medium and longer-term closures that are being considered.

6. A joint integrated traffic study should be done on the proposed traffic detour down a partially shut Railway Pde during the proposed long-term Beechboro Rd South non-local traffic closure. If it has been done, it needs to be shared with the community.
7. There appears to be a continuing lack of notice and lack of quality information for residents, businesses, sporting clubs and the like.
8. There is a risk of completely cutting of pedestrian access north and south sides of the rail line if the construction programme of Leake St underpass is delayed.
 - a. Pedestrian access from one side of the Townsite to the other is at risk, and is only ever a short-term solution, if at all. It is not physically accessible to all members of the public, nor safe, and needs suitable lighting.
9. Future Bayswater Inc do not support the six-month road closure to non-local traffic through Beechboro Rd South.
 - a. It is at odds to previous commitments made to keep the roads open for local businesses whereby the CAG and community was advised that the new Whatley Crescent link connecting directly to Beechboro Road South would be opened for traffic before Coode Street underpass was blocked off.
 - b. The closure will severely impact the livelihoods of local businesses.
 - c. It impacts residents with rat-running for far too long a period.
10. Future Bayswater Inc do not condone the long-term shut down of Bayswater Station.
 - a. It was proposed from the beginning of the project that the Bayswater Train Station would always remain open – except for a weekend or two, when the old station would be decommissioned and immediately transferred to the new station. Six months of the station being closed -- and this only being communicated at this late juncture -- is not acceptable.
 - b. The impact on the community is frankly too large to bear.
 - c. The distribution of the "free tickets" is inequitable and needs quick revision.

We would be happy to discuss the above issues with the City of Bayswater and the METRONET/ Evolve team.

Yours sincerely



Paul Shanahan
CHAIR, Future Bayswater Community Group Inc
0423 119 319

CC

Mayor Filomena Piffaretti, City of Bayswater

Lisa Baker MLA, Member for Maylands

Hon. Rita Saffioti MLA, Minister for Transport; Planning; Ports